Recent advances on magnetic carbon-related materials in advanced oxidation processes of emerging pollutants degradation

Elvana Çako a,*, Kumaravel Dinesh Gunasekaran b, Saravanan Rajendran c, Anna Zielińska-Jurek a, **

a Department of Process Engineering and Chemical Technology, Faculty of Chemistry, Gdańsk University of Technology, G. Narutowicza 11/12, 80-233, Gdańsk, Poland
b Trinity College Dublin, The University of Dublin, College Green, Dublin 2, D02 P640, Ireland
c Department of Mechanical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, University of Tarapacá, Avda, General Velasquez, 1775, Arica, Chile

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Magnetic carbon-related materials
Photocatalysis
S-AOP
Emerging contaminants
Pharmaceuticals degradation
Magnetic properties
Carbon nitride

ABSTRACT

Recently, carbon-related materials have been proposed to improve the charge separation of the photogenerated carriers in the semiconductor matrices and surface properties. Carbon-related materials may act as co-catalysts, enhancing the pollutants adsorption on the surface, improving the charge carriers separation and photocatalyst stability and providing more active centres for photocatalytic reactions. This review summarizes recent advances in the preparation and environmental application of carbon-related materials. The focus was set on preparation of carbon-related materials and magnetic carbon-related photocatalytic materials with the property of easy separation after the purification process in an external magnetic field and their application for degradation of emerging pollutants not susceptible to biodegradation. The present studies identify four main groups of water pollutants: pesticides, pharmaceuticals, industrial chemicals, and heavy metals. Among them, pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds represent a significant group of persistent organic pollutants. Some of the commonly used pharmaceuticals for human health, as well as disinfectants, are found in wastewater influents and effluents (after the purification process) almost in the unchanged form. Their detection in trace amounts (of about a few micrograms to hundreds of nanograms per litre) and removal become difficult but important because they put at risk the reuse of treated wastewater and the sustainability of water cycle management. Concerning levels of concentrations, these compounds are classified as hazardous due to possibilities of bioaccumulation, biomagnification and toxic impact on living organisms, even in trace amounts. Up to now, various methods have been reported in the removal of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds from aqueous systems.

Heterogeneous photocatalysis belonging to the group of advanced oxidation processes (AOPs) is one of the most promising methods used for the degradation of emerging pollutants. Introducing carbon-related materials modified by magnetic ferrites can significantly improve the efficiency of emerging contaminants’ degradation. This review provides coherent information for future studies in the application of carbon-related materials and magnetic carbon-related materials for the removal of active pharmaceutical ingredients and phenolic compounds. Insights on pharmaceutical and phenolic compounds photodegradation in the presence of carbon-based materials combined with magnetic ferrites and their combination with SR-(AOPs) and Fenton-
Water Resources and Industry 31 (2024) 100241

1. Introduction

Rapid industrialization and population growth contribute to the deterioration of water quality through the discharge of hazardous pollutants. It was predicted that by 2022, the pharmaceutical industry would know a growth rate of 6.5% per year, which means that a vast amount of pharmaceuticals are being produced due to increased consumer demand [1]. The pharmaceutical and biotechnology sectors were rated to have the highest ratio of research and development investment to net sales compared to other industrial sectors in the European Union in 2019, as presented in Fig. 1(a) [2]. The trend predicts that the pharmaceutical industry will further grow in the upcoming years. With the intensification of climate change, more diseases and infections will affect societies [3]. The pharmaceutical industry is considered to be on the front line of challenges that the planet faces during transitory times. Despite the numerous advantages the pharmaceutical industry has provided humankind, it is worth mentioning that some detrimental and irreversible impacts

Fig. 1. a) Ranking of industrial sectors, with data referred to 2500 companies worldwide in the EU (551), Japan (318), US (769), China (507), and the Rest of the World (355) [2]; b) Distribution cycle of active pharmaceuticals ingredients and phenolic compounds in the ecosystem; c) Carbon-based materials (CBM) used in photocatalysis for the removal of the selected group of pollutants.
on living organisms and ecosystems have raised concerns. In recent years, it was reported that a considerable concentration of pharmaceuticals not susceptible to biodegradation is present in fresh waters, maritime, and wastewaters worldwide [4,5]. The major groups of concern of active pharmaceutical ingredients (API) belong to hormones, antibiotics, analgesics, antidepressants and anti-cancer drugs [6–8]. The mixture of pharmaceuticals and other contaminants in water bodies increases their toxicity to the ecosystem because more adverse effects can be observed in combination with other pollutants. It can be manifested in the form of substantial biological changes and extreme cases such as species extinction [9].

Around 4000 active pharmaceutical ingredients (API) are found to be used worldwide, from which 30–90 % of oral doses are excreted as active substances [10]. The concentration of organic pollutants in the environment is closely dependent on geographical and seasonal factors, and their mobility in soil is determined by the soil/water partition coefficient, differently called organic carbon adsorption coefficient (KOC) [11]. Pharmaceuticals that tend to have low (KOC), will pass in an aqueous system through drainage waters, while high (KOC) pharmaceuticals will pass into water bodies through run-off waters [11]. The presence of pharmaceutical compounds and their concentration in the wastewater systems in different continents is presented in Table 1. In the previous studies the presence of pharmaceutical compounds in the influents and effluents of wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs) was described. For example, Pérez-Lemus et al. [12], Quesada et al. [13], Pesqueira et al. [14], and Spataro et al. [15] reported the presence of pharmaceuticals in a water environment. Moreover, various antibiotics, including sulfamethoxazole, erythromycin, trimethoprim, and trimethoprim, have been identified in the WWTPs influent situated in Southern California. Their concentrations ranged from 1.860 to 2.146 μg/L, 0.0167–0.278 μg/L, 0–0.410 μg/L, and 0.407–1.021 μg/L, respectively [16].

It has been reported that the release of pharmaceuticals into surface waters induced severe changes in the endemic system of wild fish species [17]. The presence of different classes of pharmaceuticals has been found in many water bodies in relatively harmful concentrations. There are many ways that pharmaceuticals enter the aqueous systems. They are released through industrial effluents, hospital and veterinary waste discharges, human and animal excreta, treated sewage sludge, biosolids, and landfill leachates Fig. 2 (a) [18].

Phenolic compounds are the next group of compounds that are extensively found in the environment, as presented in Fig. 2 (b). They originate from natural and anthropogenic sources. Natural sources of phenol include the decomposition of inorganic matter, synthesis by microorganisms, and synthesis by plants [24–26]. Related to anthropogenic sources, phenol discharges from municipal, agricultural, domestic, and industrial effluents. Discharged effluents from various industries like petrochemical, pharmaceuticals, food processing, metallurgy, plastics, paint, agricultural, rubber, and textile industries are the main sources of phenol and its derivatives [27]. The presence of phenol in the environment has adverse effects on aqueous and terrestrial biota, and its estimated concentration has been reported to be in the range of 1–100 mg/L [28]. It was reported that 3.6 % of soil and groundwater contaminants constitute of phenol and its derivatives (European Environment Agency EEA, 2019) [29]. Interaction of phenol with other organic and inorganic compounds leads to the formation of other by-products, which can be more toxic than their parent molecule [30].

In this regard, it is necessary to provide advanced treatment methods of effluents containing trace amounts of persistent organic pollutants before their discharge in aqueous systems. The main group of treatment methods consists of conventional treatment and advanced oxidation processes. The conventional treatment methods are performed using the activated sludge microorganisms, coagulation, filtration, sand filtration, and electrokinetic remediation [31]. At the same time, advanced wastewater treatment

Table 1
Pharmaceutical active compounds in wastewater systems in different countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Source of Study</th>
<th>Class of Pharmaceutical compound</th>
<th>Active compound present</th>
<th>Concentration detected</th>
<th>Method of detection</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>Warta river</td>
<td>Non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs</td>
<td>Ibuprofen</td>
<td>0.1346 μg/L</td>
<td>HPLC-ESI-MS/MS</td>
<td>[19]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>wastewater treatment plant in Riga</td>
<td>Anti-inflammatory analgesic drug antibiotics anti-epileptics</td>
<td>Acetaminophen, Ciprofloxacin</td>
<td>12 μg/L, 4 μg/L</td>
<td>HPLC-MS</td>
<td>[20]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Water treatment plant, New Jersey USA</td>
<td>non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drug</td>
<td>Ibuprofen, Caffeine, Iopamidol</td>
<td>233 ng/L, 984 ng/L</td>
<td>LC-MS</td>
<td>[21]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>Wastewater treatment plant</td>
<td>non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drug</td>
<td>Ibuprofen, Naproxen</td>
<td>60 μg/L, 64 μg/L</td>
<td>UHPLC-MS</td>
<td>[22]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Yellow river, Beijing</td>
<td>non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drug</td>
<td>Caffeine, Acetaminophen, Naproxen</td>
<td>120 μg/L, 14.9 μg/L</td>
<td>HPLC-MS/MS</td>
<td>[23]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
processes consist of advanced oxidation processes, reverse osmosis, and membrane treatment.

Photocatalysis is one of the successful methods that consists of removing persistent organic pollutants, and it is also classified as a green technology. The principle of photocatalysis is the generation of a photoinduced electron/hole (e⁻/h⁺) pairs through the photon excitation of a semiconductor [32]. Some photogenerated charge carriers will recombine, while others will migrate to the surface of the photocatalyst, participating in redox reactions with adsorbed organic molecules [33]. Photoexcited electrons are transferred from the valence band to the conduction band, while holes are unoccupied states within the valence band region of the material. The semiconductors that have more positive (VB) initiate oxidation reactions and generation of oxidation species, while more negative (CB) semiconductors demonstrate reduction properties [34].

The present review is focused on the application of photocatalysis for the remediation of wastewaters from pharmaceutical and phenolic compounds. The investigation of studies was concentrated on a timeframe of 13 years, from 2010 to 2023 (see in Fig. 3). The search of the literature was narrowed down from photocatalytic degradation of organic pollutants with carbon-related materials (CRM) to photocatalytic degradation of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds. Furthermore, the review is focused on the topic of...
The photocatalytic degradation of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds using magnetic carbon-related materials, which consisted of a relatively low number of articles of around 212 as compared to 2024 for the search topic of photocatalytic degradation of organic pollutants with carbon materials. Therefore, pharmaceutical and phenolic compounds degradation using magnetic carbon materials provides space to further contribute with results regarding synthesis methods, improvement of properties, photocatalytic mechanism, effect of magnetic field and synergy of advanced oxidation processes combined with magnetic field.

Application of magnetic particles combined in the structure of heterocomposite with carbon-related materials (CRM) such as fullerenes, carbon nanotubes, graphene oxide, reduced graphene oxide, carbon quantum dots and graphitic carbon nitride (g-C₃N₄) for degradation of different pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds in the aqueous phase was reported. Additionally, hybrid oxidation systems of sulfate radical-based advanced oxidation processes SR-(AOP) and Fenton-type photocatalysis were discussed.
2. Carbon-related materials

Recently, carbon-related materials have attracted much attention due to their significant structural and textural properties, superior thermal and mechanical stability, and the possibility of a wide range of applications, as shown in Fig. 3. Carbon-related materials come in a variety of forms, including zero-dimensional fullerenes (C60, C70), one-dimensional carbon nanotubes, two-dimensional graphene, graphene oxide (GO), reduced graphene oxide (rGO), carbon quantum dots (CQDs), and graphitic carbon nitride (g-C3N4) [Fig. 4]. Carbon-related materials play remarkable roles in photocatalysis as cocatalysts and supporting materials due to their developed surface area, nontoxicity, cost-effectiveness, and abundance [35]. Moreover, carbon-based materials are applied in capacitors, batteries, electronics, membranes, heterogeneous catalysis, wastewater treatment, bioengineering, and drug delivery [36].

Fullerenes are hollow spherical carbon structures, synthesised for the first time by Eiji Osawa in 1970, using a graphite irradiated with a laser beam under a helium atmosphere [37,38]. Fullerenes with a general formula of C2n–24h, where H stands for hexagonal faces, consists of a few carbon units up to hundreds of carbon units, with the most common structures of 60-carbon units and 70-carbon units [38,39]. 60-carbon units (C60), differently known as Buckminster fullerene, exhibit 5-fold symmetry and consists of a spherical shape that holds 12 pentagons and 20 hexagon rings, where each carbon particle is bonded with three carbon particles with sp3 hybridization [40]. Due to their hydrophobic properties, fullerenes can be modified with polar functional groups to increase their solubility in water [41]. The activity of fullerenes can be improved through the chemical functionalization of their hollow cage with alkali and transitional metals [42,43], nonmetal [44], metal oxides [45]. The functionalization of fullerenes with other carbon-related materials such as graphitic carbon nitride, graphene, and carbon nanotubes was investigated. The heterojunction contributes to the preparation of hybrid materials with a defined morphology, improved redox properties, effective charge carriers separation, and increased transfer rate of photogenerated charges. Pi (π) conjugated photocatalytic materials are created when C60 and g-C3N4 are combined, which accelerates the separation of photogenerated charges and decreases the bandgap energy of composite materials, making it photocatalytically active under visible light irradiation [46]. Ma et al. [47] reported that the morphology of g-C3N4 changed from flat to wrinkled when adding C60, where C60 is positioned upon the nitrogen junction with the carbon atom of fullerene. The role of nitrogen (N2) of g-C3N4 in the C60/g-C3N4 composite was explained by Li et al. [48], who reported that a type (II) heterojunction was formed between C60 and g-C3N4, where C60 molecules interacted with unsaturated N2 of g-C3N4 causing a bending of g-C3N4 sheet which significantly improved transfer rate between two constituents. The combination of C60 with graphene promotes suitable materials for energy storage, energy generation and electronic devices. Molecular arrangement in such heterostructures defines the charge separation ability in the material. Ojeda-Aristizabal et al. [49] reported that C60 orientation in the graphene layer was responsible for the charge transfer efficiency at the C60/graphene interface. A combination of fullerene with different carbon allotropes like activated carbon, mesoporous carbon and carbon nanotubes can be applied in high-performance energy storage devices due to their electronic, electric, and textural properties [50]. Intercalation of fullerene with various carbon hybrids remains a challenge in the composite formation due to the high stability of C60 that disrupts the layers of graphene and graphene oxide, low agglomeration, and the need to derivatize the constituents chemically to increase their solubility and assists the heterojunction formation [51].

Carbon nanotubes (CNT) with exceptional strength to weight ratio, chemical stability, thermal and electrical conductivity, large surface area and remarkable mechanical strength [52] are resistant materials, demonstrating 100 GPA of strength and 1000 GPA of stiffness [53]. CNT exists as one-dimensional material (1D), and based on the number of layers, it is divided into single-wall nanotubes (SWNT), double-wall nanotubes (DWNt) and multi-wall nanotubes (MWNT) [54]. The distinctive structure of carbon nanotubes (CNTs) consists of carbon atoms organised in a hexagonal lattice rolled into cylindrical tubes, where these layers are strongly held together through a delocalized electron cloud formed by sp2 hybridization of carbon atoms [53]. The chemical and physical stability of CNTs is attributed to the strong carbon-carbon bonds. When exposed to potent oxidising substances or high temperatures, carbon nanotubes are oxidised. This potential has the potential to modify the surface of CNTs by adding oxygen-containing functional groups like carbonyl (-COOH) and hydroxyl (-OH), contributing to their reactivity. Chemical functionalization of CNTs provides these materials with solubility and compatibility properties to ease their interaction with other materials [55]. The preparation methods of CNTs consist of the chemical vapour method, laser deposition, and arc discharge [56,56]. CNTs efficiency can be improved by modifying their structure with nonmetals, metals, and various semiconductors [57–60].

Graphene, graphene oxide (GO), and reduced graphene oxide (r-GO) are the next group of carbon-based materials. Graphene-based materials find applications in electronics, electrochemical sensors, energy storage, biosensors, and drug delivery systems [61–64]. A honeycomb lattice of zero, one, and three-dimensional graphene (0D, 1D, 2D, and 3D) are synthesised utilizing self-assembly techniques, vacuum filtration, thermal decomposition, chemical vapour deposition, solution dispersion technique and other [65,66]. Chemical functionalization of the graphene layer leads to the fabrication of graphene oxide (GO), a material with low conductivity properties. To overcome this drawback, reduced graphene oxide is introduced as an alternative. The first attempt of graphene oxide (GO) preparation dates back to 1859, when Brodie obtained GO through the oxidation of graphene by potassium chlorate (KClO3) and nitric acid (HNO3) at 60 °C [67]. In 1958, the Hummers’ method was proposed as more efficient compared to Brodie and consisted of using KMnO4, NaNO3 and concentrated H2SO4 [68]. Nevertheless, this method was reported to release toxic gasses, and it was found necessary to improve it further. The modified Hummers’ method replaced HNO3 with a less corrosive acid of H3PO4, reducing the release of toxic gasses and increasing GO synthesis efficiency [69]. Later on, various different approaches were reported to synthesise photocatalytic active GO. Chemical functionalization of graphene enriched the structure with oxygen-containing functional groups, which impacted the dispersion rate, adsorption, and electronic properties of GO.

GO is the main precursor of reduced graphene oxide (rGO). Synthesis methods of reduced graphene oxide (rGO) include photochemical, thermal reduction, electrochemical reduction, microwave, chemical, and microbial techniques, which reduce the amount of oxygen in the functionalized (GO) layer [70]. The exceptional activity of GO and rGO can be achieved through modification of these
materials as GO/rGO [71] or as a modification with metal atoms (M) and metal oxides (MO), notably expressed as GO/M [72], GO/MO [73], GO/M-MO [74] and rGO/M [75], rGO/MO [76], and rGO/M-MO [77]. In combination with different semiconductors, rGO can provide properties like effective transport of photogenerated charges, improved separation of electron-holes pairs, increased adsorption rate toward the contaminant molecules, and the ability to immobilize and support the combined material [78]. Sodeinde et al. [79] confirmed that the presence of rGO increased the separation efficiency of photogenerated charge carriers and increased the adsorption capacity and conductivity of rGO/ZnO for the removal of chloramphenicol (CAP) antibiotic.

The next group of carbon-related materials is represented by carbon quantum dots (CQDs). CQDs are superbly used in photocatalysis for the degradation of pollutants in water, hydrogen generation, and CO2 conversion [80–83]. CQDs can be prepared using top-down and bottom-up approaches. The top-down methods include chemical oxidation, ultrasonication, electrochemical techniques, arc discharge, and laser ablation. On the other hand, the bottom-up methods involve hydrothermal synthesis, solvothermal synthesis, microwave-assisted synthesis, pyrolysis, and plasma-based procedures for various applications [84]. They were first synthesized in 2004 during the purification process of single-walled nanotubes (SWNT) via electrophoresis [85]. Later, in 2006, CQDs were effectively fabricated by laser ablation of graphite powder and cement, and their fluorescence properties were significantly enhanced [86]. CQDs are extensively utilised in medical applications, biosensing, drug delivery, chemical sensing and photocatalysis due to their affordability, environmentally sustainable characteristics, and straightforward preparation techniques [87–90]. The internal structure of CQDs consists of a carbon core, while the outer surface of CQDs is made of graphene or graphene oxide sheets, which can be modified with highly water-soluble functional groups [91]. The CQDs exhibit fluorescence properties associated with bandgap transitions resulting from the presence of conjugated π-domains and surface defects within the CQD structure [92]. The fluorescence intensity depends on surface passivation, doping, pH and particle size. Surface passivation is a crucial factor in mitigating the contamination of CQDs. This process involves the application of a thin coating of organic molecules or polymeric materials to insulate the surface of CQDs.

Coated CQDs have demonstrated higher quantum yield and fluorescence intensity than non-coated CQDs. Pan et al. [93] observed that the fluorescence intensity of carbon quantum dots (CQDs) was enhanced through surface passivation using 1-ethyl-3-(3-dimethylaminopropyl)-carbodiimide (EDC). Additionally, the quantum yield of CQDs increased from 19 % to 41 % as the concentration of EDC increased from 2.5 to 25 mM. Elemental doping of CQDs with phosphorus (P) and nitrogen (N) led to the formation of a high quantum yield of 53.8 % of CQDs, which proved to have increased monodispersity, photoluminescence and stability in a wide range of pH [94]. Furthermore, the change in the pH significantly affected the quantum yield of CQDs. According to the findings of Jia et al. [95], it was observed that the fluorescence intensity of carbon quantum dots (CQDs) reduced by 90 % when the pH of the media increased from 4 to 8. This decrease in fluorescence intensity can be attributed to the deprotonation of carboxyl groups present on the surface of the CQDs, and the shift in the Fermi level. The utilization of CQDs in conjunction with magnetic materials has proven to be highly advantageous in the field of bioimaging, namely in the areas of fluorescence imaging, magnetic resonance imaging, and computed tomography. Nitrogen-doped CQDs embedded in magnetite probes (Fe3O4) exhibited fluorescence properties with a quantum yield of 21.6 % and superparamagnetic behaviour, which classified this material as a potential contrast agent for biomedical imaging of tumours [96].

Graphitic carbon nitride (g-C3N4) is an n-type semiconductor photocatalyst with a narrow bandgap of about 2.7 eV, photocatalytic activity and visible light absorption properties [97]. The structure of g-C3N4 consists of earth-abundant elements like carbon and nitrogen, which are integrated into the form of tri-s-triazine planes or heptazine rings [97]. Connections of tri-s-triazine units with planar amino groups contribute to the chemical stability of graphitic carbon nitride (g-C3N4) [98]. The highest photocatalytic activity of g-C3N4 is achieved by fulfilling physicochemical and electronic properties of photocatalysts such as high surface area, exposed reactive sites, low bandgap, solar energy harvesting towards Vis light spectra, and efficient charge carriers separation. Different types of structures like (0D) quantum dots [99], (1D) nanorods [100], nanowires [101], nanotubes, nanoparticles [102], hollow spheres [103], (2D) nanosheets [104], films [105] and (3D) hierarchical structures [106] were reported to meet the requirement of increased photocatalytic activity for g-C3N4. Further improvements of physico-chemical properties can be achieved through modification of g-C3N4 by coupling with other semiconductors [107,108], metal and non-metal doping elements [109,110], fabrication of mesoporous structure [111], and introducing magnetic properties [112]. Various methods are used for the preparation of g-C3N4-based photocatalysts like thermal polymerization [113], hydrothermal [114], sol-gel [115], chemical functionalization [116], ultrasonication-assisted exfoliation method [117], microwave and template-assisted method [118,119].

One limitation associated with the utilization of g-C3N4 as the sole semiconductor in the photocatalytic process is the elevated recombination rate of charge carriers. Consequently, it is recommended to employ the chemical functionalization technique to establish a heterojunction between two semiconductors possessing a reduced recombination rate of electron-hole pairs [116]. To overcome the g-C3N4 limitations, elemental doping, heterocomposite formation with broad and narrow band gap semiconductors, polymeric modification, and magnetic modification was investigated. The study performed by Hu et al. [120] showed that the incorporation of potassium (K) into g-C3N4 resulted in a particle size reduction, increased surface area, a narrower band gap, and an improved rate of separation of photogenerated charge carriers (e−-h+). The concentration of precursors is a significant factor that influences the electrical characteristics of semiconductors. Previous research has indicated that the potentials of the conduction band (CB) and valence band (VB) in Na-g-C3N4 can be adjusted by controlling the sodium (Na) concentration [121]. Elemental dopants have the ability to function as trapping agents for photogenerated charges, hence impeding their potential for recombination. Tonda et al. [122] reported that Fe3+ species in iron-doped g-C3N4 acted as a trapping agent of e−-h+ pairs and mediated their separation to efficiently reduce oxygen into superoxide radicals (O2•−) and oxide hydroxyl ions (HO•) into hydroxyl radicals (HO•). Furthermore, Zn served as a bridge between layers of g-C3N4, facilitating the separation of electron holes and preventing their recombination [123]. In the study performed by Chen et al. [124] it was reported that the formation of a type (II) heterojunction between g-C3N4 nanowires and B-TiO2 tubes led to enhanced charge carriers separation. This improvement can be attributed to the charge trapping effect of pristine
g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} in conjunction with B-TiO\textsubscript{2}. The combination of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} and 2D TiO\textsubscript{2} in the form of S-scheme, yielded complete degradation of tetracycline (TC) [125].

Zinc oxide is a semiconductor that has been extensively studied for its application in the alteration of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}. Based on Scopus statistics, a total of 1965 research publications have been documented thus far pertaining to the combination of ZnO and g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}. Notably, 958 of these articles specifically address the photodegradation of xenobiotics found in wastewater. Zinc oxide (ZnO) is classified as an n-type semiconductor with a wide bandgap of 3.2 eV. This material possesses numerous advantages, including antibacterial, photocatalytic, optical, and electrical properties as well as physical and chemical stability. Ismael et al. [126] investigated the effect of ZnO/g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} (10 %) on the photodegradation of 4-chlorophenol and methyl orange (MO). In the presence of composite, improved photodegradation was observed compared to the individual components of ZnO and g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}. The ternary heterocomposite represented an additional category of junction phase development, enhancing the photocatalytic activity of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}.

The preparation of a ternary nanocomposite of ZnO-g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}-GO was studied by Zhang et al. [127] for photocatalytic degradation of rhodamine B (Rhb). It was found that the introduction of graphene oxide (GO) decreased the recombination rate of electron-hole pairs and enhanced the photocatalytic activity.

The subsequent category of materials investigated for heterocomposite synthesis with graphitic carbon nitride (g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}) consists of narrow bandgap metal oxides. The appropriate bandgap values exhibited by tungsten oxide (WO\textsubscript{3}) and g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} render these materials suitable for obtaining photoactive heterocomposites that can effectively harness visible light. Furthermore, the incorporation of silver (Ag) nanoparticles in the heterocomposite of WO\textsubscript{3}/g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} resulted in enhanced photocatalytic activity, mostly attributed to their role as electron mediators and surface plasmon resonance properties [128]. When combined with TiO\textsubscript{2} and WO\textsubscript{3}, the g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} is an electron mediator that improves the charge separation and facilitates their transfer to the interfacial site [129]. Additional narrow bandgap semiconductors, such as BiVO\textsubscript{4}, Cu2O, Ag2O, and CoS\textsubscript{4}, have been reported in the literature for the preparation of heterocomposite structures with g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} [130–133]. These composite materials have successfully removed many types of contaminants, including pharmaceuticals and organic dyes. The combination of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} and WS\textsubscript{2} formed an electric field in the interface due to the positively charged surface of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} and the negatively charged surface of WS\textsubscript{2} [134]. The generated electric field could direct the electrons (\(e^-\)) to the conduction band (CB) of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}, while holes (\(h^+\)) remain in the valence band (VB) of WS\textsubscript{2}, preventing the recombination of electron-hole pairs. The phenomenon mentioned above was also noted in the resulting heterocomposite of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}/MoS\textsubscript{2}, except that the holes (\(h^+\)) were localised in the valence band (VB) of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}, while the electrons (\(e^-\)) migrated to the conduction band (CB) of MoS\textsubscript{2} [135]. Moreover, polymers are another material used as platform supporters or membrane wrapping for g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}-based heterocomposites. Z-scheme heterocomposite of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}/BiOI supported on p-phase PVDF (polyvinylidene fluoride) efficiently degraded above 94 % of tetracycline, demonstrating thus high permeability, self-cleaning ability, and stability [136]. PVDF and PAN possess respective complementary properties like high fouling, high hydrophobicity and low fouling, high hydrophilicity, which allows these materials to form double polymeric membranes and successfully support ZnO/g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} heterocomposite [137].

The techniques mentioned above of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} modifications are known differently as the chemical functionalization technique, which is employed as covalent and non-covalent functionalization of carbon materials. Covalent functionalization is defined as the covalent bonding of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} and introduced chemical reactant, while noncovalent functionalization is attributed to electrostatic interactions, \(\pi-\pi\) bonding, hydrogen bonding, and van der Waals forces [138]. Covalent functionalization can be achieved by oxidation, hydroxylation, sulfonation, amidation, and surface defects, whereas noncovalent functionalization is an example of heterojunction formation of g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} and other semiconductors or metal oxides [139]. This technique allows us to develop modified g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}-based heterocomposites in the form of ‘Frustrated Lewis Pairs’ and apply them for wastewater remediation. There is a lack of studies concerning the application of FLP-based carbon materials in the photodegradation of organic pollutants. Therefore, below, we are introducing the concept of ‘Frustrated Lewis Pair’ with regard to carbon-related materials modifications.

A Frustrated Lewis Pair (FLP) is a compound where the Lewis acid and Lewis base cannot interact due to steric hindrances and thus will separately react with a third molecule such as H\textsubscript{2}, N\textsubscript{2}, CO\textsubscript{2}, or NO\textsubscript{2} [140,141]. FLPs have a wide range of applications, including CO\textsubscript{2} reduction, H\textsubscript{2} activation, N\textsubscript{2} fixation, organic synthesis, hydrogenation of unsaturated compounds, and pollutant removal [141,142]. The catalytic mechanism of FLPs is strongly dependent on the surface/interface designs, which can be categorized into four types of configurations: a) solid Lewis acid and molecular Lewis base, b) molecular Lewis acid and solid Lewis base, c) solid Lewis acid and solid Lewis base, and d) introducing surface defects such as oxygen vacancies, bond breakages, and doping of solid platforms [143]. The most common solid materials used for Frustrated Lewis Pairs include polymers [144], zeolites [145], 2D materials such as graphene [146], graphitic carbon nitride [147], carbon nitride C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4} [148], C\textsubscript{3}N [149], and metal organic frameworks [150]. Structure defects of carbon nitride favour the formation of a Frustrated Lewis Pair, as C and N-vacancies form the Lewis base. Some of the Lewis acid molecules used are B, Al, Ga, In, and Sn, while the Lewis base molecules are represented by C, N, O, S, P, and terminal hydroxyl groups (HO-) [151]. Surface defects of carbon nitride and exposed nitrogen sites served as a Lewis base platform when forming B-N/FLP and Al-N/FLP, where boron (B) and aluminum (Al) served as Lewis acids [149]. Defective boron carbon nitride (BN/FLP) was efficiently used in the organic synthesis of ammonia production [152]. These findings offer a potential alternative for developing efficient g-C\textsubscript{3}N\textsubscript{4}-based FLP and their application in photocatalysis and redox reactions.
and hard ferrites [154]. The crystal structure of ferrites is a very important feature and classifies them as spinel ferrites, garnet ferrites, hexaferrites, and orthoferrites, as presented in Fig. 5.

Spinel ferrite with a general formula of (MeO•Fe₂O₃; MeFe₂O₄; Me-Co, Zn, Fe, Cu, Ni, Mn, Mg), is characterized as face-centred cubic (FCC), where metallic cations are placed in the tetrahedral and octahedral sites [155]. Specifications of crystal structures of spinel ferrite classify it as normal spinel, inverse spinel, and complex spinel [156]. In normal spinel, Me (II) and Fe (III) are positioned in tetrahedral and octahedral sites, while in inverse spinel, half of Fe (III) cations are positioned in tetrahedral sites, and Me (II) and...
remaining Fe (III) are located in the octahedral site [157]. In the case of complex spinel, both metal cations are allocated irregularly in tetrahedral and octahedral sites. Examples of normal, inverse, and complex spinel are known to be ZnFe$_2$O$_4$, NiFe$_2$O$_4$ and MnFe$_2$O$_4$, respectively. Garnet ferrite is the second class of ferrites with an overall formula of (Me$_3$Fe$_5$O$_{12}$; Me- Y, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb) that demonstrate splendid chemical and structural stability due to uniform placement of cations in the tetrahedral and octahedral sites [158]. The third class of ferrites corresponds to hexaferrites with a chemical formula of (MeFe$_{12}$O$_{19}$; Me-Ba, Sr, Pb). Hexaferrites are ferrimagnetic materials that possess anisotropic properties related to the selective orientation of induced magnetization within the crystal [159].

Depending on their chemical formula and stacking sequence of three blocks, hexaferrites are classified into six types: M, W, X, Y, Z and U type [159]. Orthoferrites are a group of antiferromagnetic materials with a general formula (MeFeO$_3$; Me-Y and other earth rare metals) that crystallizes in orthorhombically distorted perovskite [160]. Based on magnetic properties, synthesised materials are classified as diamagnetic, paramagnetic, ferromagnetic, antiferromagnetic, superparamagnetic and ferrimagnetic, as presented in Fig. 6 (a) [161]. Atoms in diamagnetic materials have zero magnetic moments, which means that magnetization is in the opposite direction of the applied field [162]. Paramagnetic materials possess a magnetization in the same direction with the applied field, and magnetic moments are randomly oriented in atoms [163]. Ferromagnetic materials have strong magnetization from a parallel alignment of magnetic moments in atoms [164]. In antiferromagnetic materials, magnetic moments are antiparallel aligned in atoms, while ferrimagnetic materials possess higher saturation magnetization where magnetic moments are parallel and anti-parallel oriented [165]. The behaviour of magnetic material is characterised by magnetic parameters like saturation magnetization, remanent magnetization, and coercive field (Hc), which are analyzed from hysteresis loop (M - H) Fig. 6 (b).

Combination of spinel ferrites (AB$_2$O$_4$) and orthoferrites (RFeO$_3$) with graphene oxide (GO), reduced graphene oxide (rGO), carbon quantum dots (CQD), graphitic carbon nitride (g-C$_3$N$_4$) and carbon nanotubes (CNT) using hydrothermal, solvothermal, co-precipitation, combustion methods was reported for wastewater treatment, water splitting, CO$_2$ conversion, and energy storage, see in Supporting Material Table (S1-S4). Zhang et al. [168] studied the photodegradation of tetracycline using iron (Fe) embedded carbon nanotubes. They confirmed that Fe/CNTs fabricated at 900 °C resulted in high photodegradation rates due to increased electron transfer efficiency and charge carriers separation. Heterocomposite formation between nitrogen-doped N-CNT and g-C$_3$N$_4$ exhibited high efficiency in the removal of tetracycline (TC) and organic dyes of rhodamine B (RhB) and methyl orange (MO) [169]. In this type of heterocomposite, N/CNT served as an electron acceptor for g-C$_3$N$_4$, inhibiting thus the recombination of electron-hole pairs. CNTs can be modified to obtain specific properties.

Magnetism is one of the features needed for the effective separation of photocatalysts from the reaction media. Magnetic separation of photocatalysts decreases the content of mass loss, thus contributing to good material recyclability. The magnetism of CNTs can be achieved through structure defects, vacancies, unpaired spin of carbon atoms and incorporation of magnetic compounds with CNTs.
The characterization of the magnetic properties of heterocomposites consisting of magnetic ferrites and carbon materials is crucial for understanding the material behaviour and assessing its recyclability, see Fig. 7 (a, b). Deng et al. \[171\] synthesised carbon nanotubes and magnetite-modified CNTs to remove carbamazepine (CBZ). This type of material revealed high adsorption capacity, cost-effectiveness, high stability, and recyclability up to 6 cycles. The magnetic properties of ternary heterocomposite of g-C$_3$N$_4$/ZnFe$_2$O$_4$/rGO were investigated by Das et al. \[172\]. They confirmed the recovery ability of the heterocomposite, where a saturation magnetization (Ms) of 4.96 emu/g and the superparamagnetic behaviour of ZnFe$_2$O$_4$ were noticed. Nickel ferrite (NiFe$_2$O$_4$) loaded g-C$_3$N$_4$ was used for the total mineralization of oxytetracycline and remained stable for 10 photocatalytic degradation cycles, whereas the Ms value of 20.54 emu/g allowed the separation of the heterocomposite in an external magnetic field \[173\]. Higher saturation magnetization (Ms) value of 50.4 emu/g was obtained for NiFe$_2$O$_4$, whereas a lower Ms of 33.1 emu/g was noticed for the heterocomposite of NiFe$_2$O$_4$/MWCNT, due to non-magnetic nature of MWCNT \[174\]. The heterocomposite proved to be stable for five consecutive cycles, and a 20 % decrease in photodegradation efficiency was observed after the fifth cycle. A combination of MnFe$_2$O$_4$/GO resulted in a magnetically separable heterocomposite with Ms of 3.34 emu/g, while the Ms of pure MnFe$_2$O$_4$ was 55.58 emu/g \[175\]. Soft superparamagnetic material of bimetallic ferrite of CuNiFe$_2$O$_4$ with Ms of 29.17 emu/g, was successfully combined with g-C$_3$N$_4$, and a heterocomposite with Ms of 16.70 emu/g proved to be stable for four consecutive cycles \[176\].

Magnetic carbon-related materials expand their photocatalytic activity towards the visible light range. Heterocomposite of ZnFe$_2$O$_4$/g-C$_3$N$_4$ boosted its photocatalytic activity in the visible light region with absorption of a longer wavelength of 566 nm and band gap energy of 2.19 eV \[177\]. Combining g-C$_3$N$_4$ with MnFe$_2$O$_4$ increased the absorption properties in the UV–Vis region, while increasing the loading of MnFe$_2$O$_4$ (from 10 to 30 wt%) in the heterocomposite resulted in a narrower bandgap from 2.79 eV to 2.28 eV \[178\]. The physicochemical and magnetic properties of magnetic carbon-related materials are listed in Table 2.

Magnetic materials play a significant role in the development of heterocomposites by providing recyclability. Additionally, when subjected to an external magnetic field, these materials can influence the charge separation and surface reactions occurring on the photocatalyst. Photogenerated charge transfer can be influenced by three distinct effects: magnetoresistance effect, Lorenz force and spin polarisation, see in Fig. 7 (a). These factors collectively facilitate the efficient transfer of charge carriers to the interface.

It has been reported that in the presence of a magnetic field, the photocatalytic degradation of Congo red dye was significantly improved due to the magnetoresistance effect that facilitated the migration of charge carriers from the interface of CoFe$_2$O$_4$ and MoS$_2$.

Fig. 7. Effect of the magnetic field in charge carriers separation (a) \[190\]; Magnetic properties and recyclability of CuFe$_2$O$_4$ and CuFe$_2$O$_4$/rGO (b) \[179\].
The removal of methyl orange (MO) using commercial TiO$_2$ was reported to achieve high efficiency for an applied magnetic field of 0.28 T \[187\]. Upon reaching the surface of TiO$_2$, photons undergo a process of absorption, wherein the energy carried by these photons is assimilated by the electrons residing in the valence band of TiO$_2$. This absorption event triggers a transition of the electrons from the valence band to the conduction band, resulting in the generation of photoinduced carriers, commonly referred to as electron-hole pairs. The use of a magnetic field effectively induces the Lorentz force, which facilitates the separation of electron-hole pairs, hence suppressing charge carriers recombination and enhancing the utilization efficiency of photoinduced carriers. Moreover,

**Fig. 8.** Schematic illustration of the most common type of heterojunction between carbon materials and magnetic ferrites. Example of each type of heterocomposite formation such as type (II) and Z-scheme (a, b) [197], S-scheme (c) [198].
the application of a magnetic field facilitates the alteration of spin states in molecules and reorganises the spin-polarized electrons. This leads to the alignment of the photocatalyst band structure, resulting in improved photodegradation of pollutants [188]. A significant degradation rate of antiviral agents of Ribavirin, Chloroquine Phosphate and Arbidol was reported by Wu et al. [189] due to the ferromagnetic alignment of photocatalyst and spin-oriented electrons in the presence of photocatalyst of the form of type (II), Z-Scheme and S-Scheme heterojunction (Fig. 8). In the context of type (II) heterojunctions, the conduction band (CB) of semiconductor A exhibits a higher positive potential compared to the conduction band of semiconductor B. Additionally, the valence band (VB) of semiconductor

### Table 2
Saturation magnetization (Ms, emu/g) and bandgap energy (eV) values for magnetic carbon-related heterocomposites.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Photocatalyst</th>
<th>Ms (emu/g)</th>
<th>Bandgap energy (eV)</th>
<th>Ref</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ZnFeO₄</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>[172]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZnFeO₄/g-C₃N₄/GO (1.0 wt%)</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td>2.38</td>
<td>[177]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZnFeO₄</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZnFeO₄/g-C₃N₄ (3.0 wt%)</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NiFeO₄</td>
<td>50.40</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>[174]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NiFeO₄/MWCNT</td>
<td>33.10</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NiFeO₄/g-C₃N₄</td>
<td>20.54</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>[173]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MnFeO₄</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>[178]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MnFeO₄/g-C₃N₄ (30 wt%)</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MnFeO₄/GO</td>
<td>55.58</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>[175]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuFeO₄</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>[179]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuFeO₄/rGO</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>[179]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuNiFeO₄</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>[180]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuNiFeO₄/g-C₃N₄</td>
<td>29.17</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>[176]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuNiFeO₄/g-C₃N₄ (20 wt%)</td>
<td>16.70</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>[180]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuFeO₄</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>[180]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuFeO₄/g-C₃N₄</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MgFeO₄</td>
<td>11.30</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>[181]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MgFeO₄/TiO₂/GO</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoFeO₄</td>
<td>87.30</td>
<td>&lt;1.00</td>
<td>[182]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoFeO₄/g-C₃N₄</td>
<td>76.60</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>[183]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FeO₃</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g-C₃N₄/FeO₃</td>
<td>0.102</td>
<td>2.34</td>
<td>[184]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bi₁₂FeO₄₋ₓ</td>
<td>12.13</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>[184]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bi₁₂FeO₄₋ₓ/rGO</td>
<td>12.05</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>[185]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BaFeO₃/TiO₂</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>[185]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BaFeO₃/C₃N₄/Ag₂O</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The surface reaction of a photocatalyst is influenced by the presence of a magnetic field, leading to enhanced exposure of active sites and improved degradation rate of selected contaminants [188]. The effect of magnetic field can be quantified by the following equations (1) and (2) [191]:

\[ n_{\text{lm}} = 1 - (A_{600\text{nm}}/A_0) \]  
\[ \text{MFE} = (n_{\text{lm}}/n_{0\text{mT}})/n_{0\text{mT}} \]

where, the degradation rate of a pollutant in the absence of a magnetic field, denoted as \( n_0 \), and the degradation rate of the same pollutant in the presence of a magnetic field of a specific magnitude (mT), denoted as \( n_{\text{lmT}} \), are the variables of interest in this context. [A] stands for absorbance, and it can be replaced by concentration (C, mg\text{dm}^{-3}) of pollutants. The positive result from equation (2) suggests that the presence of a magnetic field improves the photodegradation of contaminants. Conversely, negative results indicate that the magnetic field has a suppressive influence on the photodegradation of contaminants.

According to literature review survey, there is a lack of studies that describe the magnetic field effect in the photocatalytic process in the presence of magnetic carbon-related materials. Nevertheless, Li et al. [192] reported the photodegradation activity of \( \alpha \)-Fe₂O₃/rGO for rhodamine B (Rhb) degradation in an external magnetic field. When an external magnetic field was introduced to the photocatalytic system, the magnetic moments of \( \alpha \)-Fe₂O₃ and rGO aligned parallel to the direction of the magnetic field. As a result, a greater number of photogenerated charges were transferred across the interface per unit time, leading to an increase in current density and a decrease in magnetic resistance (Mr). A negative value of Mr indicates an augmented quantity of photogenerated charges that participate in surface reactions within a certain time frame. The magnetic field plays a significant role in the surface reactions since it impacts the free radical pathway photodegradation reactions due to its effect on the lifetime of generated reactive oxygen species [193].

#### 3.1. Types of heterojunctions between carbon materials and magnetic ferrites

Heterojunction formation between carbon materials and magnetic ferrites was realised in the form of type (II), Z-Scheme and S-scheme heterojunction (Fig. 8). In the context of type (II) heterojunctions, the conduction band (CB) of semiconductor A exhibits a higher positive potential compared to the conduction band of semiconductor B. Additionally, the valence band (VB) of semiconductor
A has a relatively less negative potential in comparison to the valence band of semiconductor B [194]. The transfer of electrons ($e^-$) will occur from semiconductor A to semiconductor B, whereas the transfer of holes ($h^+$) will take place from the valence band (VB) of semiconductor B to semiconductor A. Concerning S-scheme heterojunction, it is observed that the conduction band and valence band energy levels of semiconductor A are comparatively higher than those of semiconductor B. When two semiconductors come into contact, electrons from semiconductor A, which has a high Fermi level, are transferred to semiconductor B. As a result, the contact side of semiconductor A will acquire a positive charge due to the loss of electrons, while the contact side of semiconductor B will become negatively charged as it takes these electrons. The generation of an electric field occurs when subjected to light irradiation facilitates the transfer of electrons from the conduction band (CB) of semiconductor B towards the valence band (VB) of semiconductor A [195]. Within the Z-Scheme junction, the electrons that are excited by light absorption in the conduction band (CB) of semiconductor B will transfer to the valence band (VB) of semiconductor A. Subsequently, these electrons will get associated with the photogenerated holes ($h^+$) in semiconductor A [196].

Shi et al. [199] reported that formed type (II) heterojunction of g-C$_3$N$_4$/ZnFe$_2$O$_4$ resulted in 85 % tetracycline (30 mg dm$^{-3}$) degradation within 120 min of irradiation, whereas the rate constant of reaction was 0.0133 min$^{-1}$. Z-scheme heterojunction of superparamagnetic Bi$_2$O$_2$CO$_3$/carbon nanotube/ZnFe$_2$O$_4$ was successfully implemented for the effective removal of phenolic compounds. The highest degradation was observed for 2, 4 dimethyl phenol (DMT), followed by bisphenol, 2, 4-dichlorophenol (DCP) and 2, 4-dinitrophenol (DNP) with respective percentage degradation efficiency of 95 %, 93 %, 90 % and 80 % within 120 min of irradiation [200]. Double carbon material and Fe$_2$O$_3$ Z-Scheme of Fe$_2$O$_3$/g-C$_3$N$_4$/GO was successfully used for photocatalytic removal of 3-methyl-4-nitrophenol [201]. High photodegradation efficiency of antibiotics of cefalexin and amoxicillin (20 mg dm$^{-3}$) was reported in the presence of S-scheme heterocomposite of α-Fe$_2$O$_3$/g-C$_3$N$_4$. The high stability of this photocatalyst demonstrated its practical use towards wastewater remediation [202]. Increased efficiency in the S-scheme heterojunction is attributed to the internal electric field and Columbic forces, which are generated by the spontaneous movement of electrons from higher Fermi level semiconductor to lower
Fermi level magnetic ferrite as in the case of S-scheme heterocomposite of NiFe$_2$O$_4$/g-C$_3$N$_4$, used for cefalexin degradation [198].

4. Photocatalytic degradation of emerging pollutants using magnetic ferrites/carbon-related materials

The studies on magnetic carbon-related materials for the degradation of different groups of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds were described. The group of studied pharmaceuticals belong to antiepileptic drugs (carbamazepine), anti-inflammatory drugs (diclofenac, ibuprofen), analgesic (paracetamol), antimicrobial (sulphonamide), antibiotics (cefalexin, sulfamethoxazole), penicillin type antibiotics (amoxicillin, ampicillin), quinolone type antibiotics (ciprofloxacin, ofloxacin, norfloxacin, lomefloxacin) and B-blocker agent (propanolol hydrochloride) see in Fig. 9.

Reported phenolic compounds belong to phenol, 2,4 dimethylphenol, 4-chlorophenol and 4-nitrophenol. These types of xenobiotics were studied in the presence of magnetic carbon-related materials, where CRM were mainly g-C$_3$N$_4$, GO, rGO, CNT, MWCNT, QDs, carbon allotropes (Fullerene, CNT, GO). Whereas, ferrite materials belonged to Fe$_3$O$_4$, Fe$_2$O$_4$, CoFe$_2$O$_4$, CuFe$_2$O$_4$, LaFeO$_3$, MgFe$_2$O$_4$, MnFe$_2$O$_4$, NiFe$_2$O$_4$, ZnFe$_2$O$_4$. Based on the previous studies, it was observed that reported heterocomposites were designed in the form of ferrite/CRM, ferrite/CRM/ferrite or CRM/ferrite/CRM.

The first group of ferrite carbon-related materials (CRM) belongs to ferrite-modified graphitic carbon nitride (g-C$_3$N$_4$), which was used for the degradation of pharmaceuticals. Mineralization of contaminants over g-C$_3$N$_4$ occurs through five steps. In the first two steps, contaminant molecules position themselves in the interface of g-C$_3$N$_4$ and aqueous phase, and then they will be adsorbed on g-C$_3$N$_4$. Generated reactive oxidation species like superoxide radicals O$_2^\cdot$- hydroxide radicals (HO$^\cdot$) and photogenerated holes (h$^+$) will attack the pollutant molecules. During the photodegradation process, formed by-products are desorbed from the photocatalyst surface in the aqueous solution. The photodegradation route of the contaminant molecule is shown in the Eqs (3)–(9) [202,203].

\[
\begin{align*}
h\nu + \text{CBM} / \text{Me} &- \text{Ferrite} = \text{CBM} / \text{Me} - \text{Ferrite} (h^+ + e^-) \\
e^- + O_2 & = O_2^\cdot \\
O_2^\cdot + e^- + 2H^+ & \rightarrow H_2O_2 \\
H_2O_2 + e^- & \rightarrow HO^\cdot + HO^- \\
Fe^{3+} + H_2O & \rightarrow Fe^{2+} + HO^\cdot + H^+ + e^- \\
O_2 + H_2O + CBM/Me - Ferrite - e^- = HO^\cdot + HO^- + CBM/Me - Ferrite \\
\text{Pollutant} + O_2^\cdot /HO^\cdot/h^+ /e^- = CO_2 + H_2O + by - products \ (\text{bulk solution})
\end{align*}
\] (3)–(9)

The group type of CRM/ferrite/CRM heterocomposite, represented with GO/Fe$_2$O$_3$/g-C$_3$N$_4$ photocatalyst, demonstrated a high removal rate of ciprofloxacin and terephthalic acid (20 mg dm$^{-3}$), and responsible oxidative species were found to be photogenerated holes, superoxide (O$_2^\cdot$) and hydroxyl radicals (HO$^\cdot$) [204]. The ferrite/CRM/ferrite group of photocatalyst was represented through double orthoferrite modified carbon nitride of LaFeO$_3$/g-C$_3$N$_4$/BiFeO$_3$, where a high removal rate of ciprofloxacin (10 mg dm$^{-3}$) was noticed [205]. Type (II) heterocomposite of ZnFe$_2$O$_4$/g-C$_3$N$_4$ was reported to remove 85% of tetracycline (30 mg dm$^{-3}$), through oxidative species of photogenerated holes (h$^+$), superoxide (O$_2^\cdot$) and hydroxyl radicals (HO$^\cdot$) [206]. Z-Scheme heterocomposite of NiFe$_2$O$_4$/Ag/g-C$_3$N$_4$ was reported to effectively decomposed 92.1% of tetracycline (20 mg dm$^{-3}$), whereas the oxidative species belonged to superoxide (O$_2^\cdot$) and hydroxyl radicals (HO$^\cdot$) [197].

The next group of carbon-related materials combined with ferrites belong to graphene oxide, reduced graphene oxide, carbon dots and carbon allotropes. The type of formed heterocomposite is identified as CRM/ferrite. Iron oxide (Fe$_2$O$_3$), cobalt ferrite (CoFe$_2$O$_4$) and zinc ferrite (ZnFe$_2$O$_4$) were used to form the heterocomposite between ferrite/rGO. Configuration of Fe$_2$O$_3$ rGO resulted in higher than 90% removal of tetracycline and ibuprofen in 140 min of irradiation [207]. Modification of reduced graphene oxide (rGO) with zinc ferrite (ZnFe$_2$O$_4$) resulted in 73.4% ciprofloxacin (CIP) degradation in 60 min [208].

Next modification of zinc ferrite and carbon allotropes contributed to 91.36 % norfloxacin removal within 90 min of irradiation [209]. Fabrication of nickel ferrite (NiFe$_2$O$_4$) with carbon dots yielded the effective removal of tetracycline [210]. Furthermore, carbon nanotubes (CNT) and multiwall carbon nanotubes (MWCNT) were applied for the removal of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds. They were structured as ferrite/CRM heterocomposite. Modification of MWCNT with nickel ferrite resulted in improved removal of phenolic compounds such as phenol, o-nitrophenol and p-nitrophenol [211]. Degradation of 40 mg•dm$^{-3}$ tetracycline in the presence of MnFe$_2$O$_4$/β-cyclodextrin/CNT was reported within 60 min of irradiation [212].

4.1. Photocatalytic degradation of xenobiotics using magnetic carbon-related materials and advanced oxidation processes

Heterogeneous photocatalysis, classified as an advanced oxidation process (AOP), involves the use of a semiconductor material capable of absorbing light to induce chemical transformations in the molecules of the reactants. It is considered an environmentally sustainable process due to its utilization of a photoactive solid photocatalyst and natural sunlight. The phenomenon of heterogeneous photocatalysis can manifest through a series of sequential steps. The processes involved in photocatalysis can be categorized as follows: a) the absorption of light, b) the excitation of charges, c) the movement of charged carriers towards the surface of the photocatalyst, d)
the commencement of reduction reactions through the photogenerated electrons (e⁻) [213]. To achieve a highly active photocatalyst, it is necessary to fulfill the following criteria: a) efficient absorption of light across a broad range of solar light wavelength, b) appropriate positioning of the semiconductor’s energy bands, c) minimal recombination rate of electron-hole pairs (e⁻·h⁺), and d) a large surface area with exposed active sites that promote redox reactions [214].

The discussed criteria can be achieved by photocatalyst fabrication and a combination of photocatalysis with advanced oxidation processes (AOPs). Sulfate-based radical advanced oxidation processes and (SR-AOP) and Fenton AOP are two of the alternatives used as additional sources of reactive oxidation species (ROS) such as hydroxyl (HO•), superoxide (O₂•⁻), singlet oxygen (¹O₂) and sulfate radicals (SO₄¹⁻) for efficient degradation and mineralization of persistent organic pollutants. Persulfate serves as a general term for sulfate-based advanced oxidation processes (AOPs), which encompass peroxydisulfate (PDS; S₂O₈²⁻) and peroxymonosulfate (PMS; HSO₅⁻) as specific examples. Peroxydisulfate salts (PDS) are present in three different forms, including ammonia (NH₄)₂S₂O₈, potassium K₂S₂O₈, and sodium Na₂S₂O₈ peroxydisulfate. Among these salts, sodium peroxydisulfate (Na₂S₂O₈) is considered to be more stable and environmentally benign when compared to the other two salts [215]. Na₂S₂O₈ is particularly attractive among many PDS salts due to its cost-effectiveness (0.18 USD/mol) and excellent solubility (556 g/L at 20 °C) [216]. Sulfate radical-based advanced oxidation processes (SR-AOPs) are regarded as even more effective alternatives to hydroxyl and superoxide radicals, primarily due to their higher redox potential of (E₀ = 2.5–3.1 V) compared to (E₀ = 1.9–2.7 V) for hydroxyl radicals (HO•) [217]. Peroxymonosulfate (PMS) exists as the triple salt of potassium peroxyoxonosulfate (2KHSO₅KH₂SO₄K₂SO₄) and is dissociated into the anion of peroxyoxonosulfate (HSO₅⁻), which was first reported by Heinrich Caro and derived from Caro’s acid or peroxysulfuric acid (H₂SO₅) [218,219]. PMS, also known as oxone is comparatively stable with a solubility of 250 g/L at 20 °C, is inexpensive, and is non-toxic [220]. The pH of reaction media defines the dissociation form of PDS and PMS, for instance, in acidic pH media, PDS dissociates in the form of (SO₄²⁻), while for pH lower than 9.4, PMS dissociates in the form of (HSO₅⁻), further, for the pH value above 9.4 PMS dissociates as (SO₄¹⁻) [221]. In the pH range of 2–7, the predominant oxidative species are sulfate radicals (SO₄¹⁻), while from pH 7 to 10, both sulfate (SO₄²⁻) and hydroxyl (HO•) radicals are present [222]. Several techniques are employed to activate persulfate, including thermal treatment [223,224], sonolysis [225], UV irradiation [226], UV–Vis irradiation [227], solar light irradiation [228], transition metal ions [229,230] and carbon-based materials [231].

Carbon materials are often regarded as a favourable option owing to their advantageous characteristics, including low toxicity, non-leaching properties, high abundance, stability, reusability, and large surface area [232,233]. The enhancement of the redox process is achieved through the modification of carbon materials using metal ions and their corresponding oxides. Furthermore, the utilization of metal ferrites in the form of magnetic nanocomposites surpasses the effectiveness of the PS-activated system. This superiority is observed in terms of improved PS activation, as well as the enhanced reusability and convenient recovery of the photocatalyst. Hence, an assessment was conducted to determine the impact of metal-ferrite/CMB triggered by PS on various types of priority is observed in terms of improved PS activation, as well as the enhanced reusability and convenient recovery of the photo-catalyst [214].

The degradation of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds using a persulfate-assisted photocatalytic system proceeds through free radical and non-radical pathway reaction mechanisms. Free radical pathway reaction consists of the generation of reactive oxidation species of sulfate (SO₄¹⁻), hydroxyl (HO•), and superoxide radicals (O₂•⁻). The reaction rate constant (M⁻¹s⁻¹) of reactive oxidation species (ROS) were estimated with regard to scavenging agents of tert-butyl alcohol (TBA), ethanol, p-BQ and sodium azide (NaN₃), and they were determined to be 3.8–7.6 × 10⁶ M⁻¹s⁻¹ (HO•), 1.6–7.8 × 10⁴ M⁻¹s⁻¹ (SO₄¹⁻), 9.4 × 10⁵ M⁻¹s⁻¹ (O₂•⁻) and 3.2 × 10⁷ M⁻¹s⁻¹ (¹O₂) [244,245]. The presence of radicals in the photocatalytic system is confirmed by scavenging experiments and electron spin resonance. Scavenging agents of para benzoquinone (P-BQ), EDTA, tert butyl alcohol (TBA), and isopropanol (IPA) were used to identify reactive oxidation species of O₂•⁻, h⁺, HO• and SO₄¹⁻ in the photocatalytic system of CoFe₂O₄/Fe₂O₃/g-C₃N₄ for degradation of pharmaceuticals [237]. From experiments, it was observed that HO• and SO₄¹⁻ were responsible for the high degradation efficiency of tetracycline (TC; 99.7 %), sulfamethoxazole (SMX; 94.8 %), diclofenac (DC; 97 %), ibuprofen (IBU; 96.1 %) and ofloxacin (OFX; 96.5 %). This result was further observed via electron paramagnetic resonance (EPR), confirming the free radical pathway [16].
Persulfate-activated magnetic carbon-related materials for photodegradation of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds.

Table 3
Persulfate-activated magnetic carbon-related materials for photodegradation of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ferrites</th>
<th>Type of catalyst</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>Ref</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FeO₃</td>
<td>Fe₂O₃/γ-C₃N₄</td>
<td>Carbamazepine (2 mg dm⁻³); Catalyst dosage (0.3 g dm⁻³); 70 min irradiation time; High removal rate of carbamazepine; Vis light source (λ &lt; 400 nm; 300 W Xenon lamp); PS Stable after 5 cycles. HO* SO₂⁻ (2 mM)</td>
<td>[236]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoFeO₄</td>
<td>CoFeO₄/Fe₂O₃/γ-C₃N₄ (Z-Scheme); Self-assembly method</td>
<td>Tetracycline (TC); Bisphenol A (BPA); sulfamethoxazole (SMX); diclofenac (DFC); ibuprofen (IBP); oltocin (OFX) (30 mg dm⁻³); Catalyst dosage (0.33 g dm⁻³); Vis light source (λ &gt; 400 nm; 500 W Xenon lamp; 80 min reaction time; PS [30 mg/30 mL]; High removal efficiency ≥ 95%; Stable after 5 cycles. HO* SO₂⁻</td>
<td>[237]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuFeO₄</td>
<td>CuO/CuFeO₄/γ-C₃N₄; Calcination method</td>
<td>Tetracycline hydrochloride (20 mg dm⁻³); Catalyst dosage (0.1 g dm⁻³); 300 W Xenon lamp; PS concentration (1.0 mmol/L); High removal efficiency; Stable after 4 cycles. O₂⁻· h⁺ HO*</td>
<td>[238]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoFeO₄</td>
<td>rGO/CoFeO₄ Hydrothermal method</td>
<td>Propranolol hydrochloride (0.02 mM); Catalyst dosage (1 g dm⁻³); Vis light source (λ &gt; 420 nm); 350 W Xenon lamp; PS concentration (0.2 mM); High removal efficiency. O₂⁻· h⁺ HO* SO₂⁻</td>
<td>[239]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FeO₃</td>
<td>Fe₂O₃/CNT; Chemical vapour deposition</td>
<td>4-Chlorophenol (10 mg dm⁻³); Catalyst dosage (0.4 g dm⁻³); Direct solar light; High removal rate; 120 min irradiation time; PMS (60 mg dm⁻³); Stable catalyst after 3 cycles, HO* SO₂⁻</td>
<td>[240]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CuFeO₄</td>
<td>CQD/Ag/CuFeO₄ Hydrothermal</td>
<td>Tetracycline (10 mg dm⁻³); Catalyst dosage (0.3 g dm⁻³); Vis light source (Xe-lamp 150 W); 5 cycle stability; O₂⁻· h⁺</td>
<td>[242]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FeO₃</td>
<td>CQD/FeO₃ Solvothermal</td>
<td>Sulfamethoxazole (10 mg dm⁻³); Vis light source (Xe-lamp 300 W); High removal of SMX. HO* SO₂⁻</td>
<td>[243]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

reaction mechanism for the degradation of pharmaceuticals. Successful degradation of tetracycline (99 %) was achieved in the presence of CuFe₂O₄/g-C₃N₄/CuO via a free radical pathway reaction mechanism assisted by oxidation species of HO*, O₂⁻ and photoinduced holes (h⁺) [238]. Additionally, the presence of HO* and O₂⁻ was confirmed using 5,5-dimethyl-1-pyrrolin-N-oxide (DMPO) as a trapping agent in electron spin resonance (ESR). No signals of DMPO-SO₂⁻ were noticed, which can be explained by the implementation of SO₂⁻ radicals to oxidize H₂O and produce HO*. A high degradation rate of propranolol hydrochloride via CuFe₂O₄/g-C₃N₄ was achieved via reactive oxidation species of HO*, O₂⁻, SO₂⁻* and h⁺ [239]. The intense signals of DMPO-SO₂⁻, DMPO-HO*, and DMPO-O₂⁻ confirming the presence of reactive species were observed in ESR, and it further proved that the degradation mechanism occurred via free radical pathway reaction. Nevertheless, the presence of singlet oxygen (¹O₂) was also observed in spin-trapped peaks since the trapping agent of 4-oxo-2,2,6,6-tetramethylpiperidine (TEMP) and ¹O₂ signal intensified from 0 to 10 min. The observation demonstrated that the reaction process occurs via a non-radical pathway along the free radical pathway. Data on PS-activated photocatalytic systems are presented in Table 3.

Non-radical pathway consists of singlet oxygen (¹O₂), electron transfer, and direct oxidation. In the reviewed literature, it was observed that non-radical pathways could occur along with free radical pathway reaction, and in most studies, the non-radical
Reduction Potentials (V) and reaction rates of anions and their respective radical form.

### Table 4

**Fenton-like processes induced by magnetically modified carbon based materials and photocatalysis for degradation of pharmaceuticals and phenols.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ferrites</th>
<th>Type of catalyst</th>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fe$_3$O$_4$</td>
<td>Fe$_3$O$_4$/rGO-ATP (Hydrothermal method)</td>
<td>Ciprofloxacin (50 mg dm$^{-3}$)</td>
<td>[251]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoFe$_2$O$_4$</td>
<td>RGO g-C$_3$N$_4$/CoFe$_2$O$_4$ (Hydrothermal method)</td>
<td>4-Nitrophenol</td>
<td>[252]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZnFe$_2$O$_4$</td>
<td>CdS/r-GO/ZnFe$_2$O$_4$ (Hydrothermal method)</td>
<td>Tetracycline</td>
<td>[253]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe$_3$O$_4$</td>
<td>Fe$_3$O$_4$/CNT (Bulk Milling strategy method)</td>
<td>Sulfonamides</td>
<td>[254]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe$_3$O$_4$</td>
<td>Fe$_3$O$_4$/C/MWCNT (Coprecipitation method)</td>
<td>Paracetamol, Phenol</td>
<td>[255]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZnFe$_2$O$_4$</td>
<td>Bi$_2$O$_3$CO$_3$/CNT/ZnFe$_2$O$_4$ (Hydrothermal method)</td>
<td>2,4-dimethylphenol (1 × 10$^{-4}$ mol dm$^{-3}$); Catalyst dosage (0.5 g dm$^{-3}$); Irradiation source 35 W LED lamps; H$_2$O$_2$: 94 % removal; Fenton AOP</td>
<td>[256]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anions</th>
<th>Formed radical</th>
<th>Reduction Potential (V)</th>
<th>Reaction rate (M$^{-1}$s$^{-1}$)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cl$^-$</td>
<td>Cl$^*$</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>4.3 × 10$^{10}$</td>
<td>[260,261]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO$_3^{2-}$</td>
<td>CO$_2^-$</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.1 × 10$^{5}$</td>
<td>[265]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HCO$_3^-$</td>
<td>HCO$_2^-$</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>3.9 × 10$^{6}$</td>
<td>[273]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO$_2^-$</td>
<td>NO$_2^-$</td>
<td>2.3-2.5</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>[269]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PO$_4^{3-}$</td>
<td>PO$_4^{2-}$</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>1.1 × 10$^{9}$</td>
<td>[272,273]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SO$_4^{2-}$</td>
<td>SO$_4^{2-}$</td>
<td>2.5-3.1</td>
<td>6.5 × 10$^{7}$</td>
<td>[274]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A combination of iron ferrites supported carbon-based catalysts and hydrogen peroxide (H$_2$O$_2$) generates hydroxyl radicals (HO$^*$).
through heterogeneous Fenton and photo-Fenton reactions. Ferrous ions will be oxidised into ferric ions and generate hydroxyl radicals, further, they will be reduced into ferrous ions and render the cycle of HO\textsuperscript{\ (+)} generation. The acidic pH media of 3.0 is required to avoid the precipitation of ferric ions (Fe\textsuperscript{3+}) and sludge formation. The Fenton’s reaction is presented in the following equations Eqs 16–20 [257–259]:

\[
\text{Fe}^{2+} + \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \rightarrow \text{Fe}^{3+} + \text{HO}^{\cdot} + \text{HO}^{-} \quad k = 40 - 80 \left( \text{L} \cdot \text{mol}^{-1} \cdot \text{s}^{-1} \right)
\]

(16)

\[
\text{Fe}^{3+} + \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \rightarrow \text{Fe}^{2+} + \text{HO}_2^{\cdot} + \text{H}^+ \quad k = 9.1 \times 10^7 \left( \text{L} \cdot \text{mol}^{-1} \cdot \text{s}^{-1} \right)
\]

(17)

\[
\text{H}_2\text{O}_2 + \text{HO}^{\cdot} \rightarrow \text{HO}_2^{\cdot} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad k = 1.7 - 4.5 \times 10^7 \left( \text{L} \cdot \text{mol}^{-1} \cdot \text{s}^{-1} \right)
\]

(18)

\[
\text{HO}_2^{\cdot} + \text{HO}^{\cdot} \rightarrow \text{O}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad k = 1.4 \times 10^{10} \left( \text{L} \cdot \text{mol}^{-1} \cdot \text{s}^{-1} \right)
\]

(19)

\[
\text{HO}^{\cdot} + \text{HO}^{\cdot} \rightarrow \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \quad k = 5 - 8 \times 10^6 \left( \text{L} \cdot \text{mol}^{-1} \cdot \text{s}^{-1} \right)
\]

(20)

The increased efficiency of contaminants degradation in the presence of the Fenton process can be explained through the oxidation of ferrous ions into ferric ions (Eq (14)), which, in further reactions with hydrogen peroxide, will generate an increased number of hydroxyl radicals. It was reported that a combination of Fe\textsuperscript{3+}/CNT and H\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{2} yields high removal rates of sulphonamide drugs (sulphanilamide, sulfamerazine, sulfadimethoxine, sulfadiazine, sulfamethazine and sulfamethoxydiazine) [254]. Coupled photo-Fenton like system of carbon/MWCNT/Fe\textsubscript{3+}/sulphonamide drugs resulted in 80 % tetracycline removal and 59.2 % TOC mineralization rate within 60 min irradiation time [253].

4.2. Effect of water matrices, pH, natural organic matter (NOM), and temperature in the degradation of pollutants

The photocatalytic performance of heterocomposites in natural waters is highly affected by the presence of coexisting ions (Cl\textsuperscript{−}, CO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{2−}, HCO\textsubscript{3}, NO\textsubscript{3}, SO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{2−}, PO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{3−}), pH, natural organic matter, and temperature. Present ions may act as quenching factors in the degradation of pollutants due to their interaction with hydroxyl radicals. Chlorine ions (Cl\textsuperscript{−}) in reaction with hydroxyl and sulfate radicals can be transformed into Cl\textsuperscript{2−} (2.4 V) and Cl\textsuperscript{3−} (2.0 V) radicals that have lower reduction potentials as compared to HO\textsuperscript{−} (2.8 V) and SO\textsuperscript{4}\textsuperscript{2−} (2.5–3.1 V) [260,261]. Chlorine can react with hydroxyl radicals and decrease the degradation rate of organic pollutants, and they can be produced according to Eq 21–23 [262,263].

\[
\text{Cl}^− + \text{HO}^{\cdot} \rightarrow \text{ClO}^{\cdot} + \text{H}^+ \quad \text{(21)}
\]

\[
\text{ClO}^{\cdot} + \text{H}^+ \rightarrow \text{Cl}^− + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad \text{(22)}
\]

\[
\text{SO}_4^{2−} + \text{Cl}^− \rightarrow \text{SO}_4^{2−} + \text{Cl}^− \quad \text{(23)}
\]

At the same time, chloride radicals may participate in the degradation of organic contaminants. Degradation of ciprofloxacin (CIP) through radical pathway mechanism, demonstrated to be inhibited in the presence of HCO\textsubscript{3} ions due to their interaction with hydroxyl radicals HO\textsuperscript{−} (2.8 V) that tend to form less reactive radicals like CO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{2−} (1.59 V) [264,265]. In the case of Fenton-like processes, bicarbonate ions HCO\textsubscript{3} will directly react with the source of hydrogen peroxide (H\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{2}) and produce peroxymonocarbonate (HCO\textsubscript{4}). In this way, bicarbonate ions reduce the amount of oxidant to convert into hydroxyl radicals (HO\textsuperscript{−}) Eq (24) [266]. The same effect was observed in the PMS-activated photocatalytic system, where HCO\textsubscript{3} reacted with PMS according to Eq (25) to produce peroxymonocarbonate ions (HCO\textsubscript{4}) [267].

\[
\text{HCO}_3^- + \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \rightarrow \text{HCO}_4^- + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad \text{(24)}
\]

\[
\text{HCO}_3^- + \text{HCO}_3^- \rightarrow \text{HCO}_4^- + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad \text{(25)}
\]

Liu et al. [241] reported that in low concentrations, hydrogen carbonate ions (HCO\textsubscript{3}) can also activate PDS; excess concentrations of HCO\textsubscript{3} will capture SO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{2−} and HO\textsuperscript{−} to produce lower redox potential radicals of CO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{2−}. The presence of a high concentration of CO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{2−} inhibits the oxidation process of pollutant, but in low concentration, it was reported to play the role of a single-electron oxidant that assists in electron transfer; hence, it was reported that it incited the degradation process of lomefloxacin (LFX) [268]. Nitrate ions can react with hydroxyl and sulfate radicals and produce nitrate radicals (NO\textsuperscript{3−}) that have lower reduction potential (2.3–2.5 V) as compared to hydroxyl radicals (2.8 V) and sulfate radicals (2.5–3.1 V); thus lower degradation rates can be observed in the presence of nitrate radicals [269,270]. The reaction of nitrate ions with sulfate radicals is demonstrated in the following equation Eq (26) [271].

\[
\text{NO}_3^- + \text{SO}_4^{2−} \rightarrow \text{NO}_3^- + \text{SO}_4^{2−} \quad \text{(26)}
\]

Reaction of phosphate ions (PO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{3−}) with hydroxyl radicals (HO\textsuperscript{−}) and sulfate radicals (SO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{2−}) leads to the formation of phosphate radicals (PO\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{3−}) and contributes to low photocatalytic activity of photocatalyst [272,273].
The next factor affecting the efficacy of contaminants removal is the pH of the reaction media. Actual wastewaters possess a variability of pH, and the pH of aqueous media influences the surface properties of photocatalysts, dissociation forms of contaminant molecules and reactive radicals. The optimal pH for the degradation of a contaminant is expected to be the pH at which the contaminant molecule exists in ionic form with the opposite charge as compared to the charge of the surface of the catalyst. Erim et al. [275] reported that using ternary photocatalyst of SWCNT/ZnO/FeO4, the highest degradation of cefixime (CFX) was achieved at pH 6, which is explained by electrostatic interactions of positively charged photocatalyst for pH < 7.69 (pzc = 7.69) and negatively charged CFX\(^{2-}\) (pH < 3.45). Removal of 2, 4-dimethylphenol using 20 % BiO\(_2\)CO\(_2\)/CNT/ZnFeO\(_4\) was observed to be higher under acidic pH media due to its zwitter ionic state that could be easily adsorbed on the positively charged surface of photocatalyst through HO• interaction ion [256]. Another aspect of pH determination stands for the efficiency of combined photocatalysis and advanced oxidation processes (AOP) like the Fenton process and sulfate radical AOP process. Generation of hydroxyl radicals (HO•) during Fenton’s reaction (iron salt + H\(_2\)O\(_2\)) takes place under acidic pH media [276]. The heterogeneous photo Fenton process results in the formation of hydroxyl radicals HO• in acidic pH media and light irradiation (solar light or visible light) [277]. Maintenance of pH 3 is important to avoid Fe\(^{2+}\) precipitation. Heterogeneous photo-Fenton loaded on solid catalysts is an advantageous method as compared to the homogeneous Fenton process since it includes the use of ferrite/carbon materials based photocatalysts which are easily recovered, have low toxicity and good stability [250]. Utilization of 0.5 g dm\(^{-3}\) of TiO\(_2\)/GO/FeO\(_4\) (18 wt%) combined with H\(_2\)O\(_2\) at pH 3 allowed to remove more than 90 % amoxicillin (AMX) within 120 min under visible light irradiation [278]. Lai et al. [279] reported that 95 % tetracycline was degraded at a natural pH of 5.5 using 0.5 g dm\(^{-3}\) MnFeO\(_4\)/biochar and 100 mM H\(_2\)O\(_2\) for 120 min irradiation time. Related to the SR-AOPs, the formation of reactive radical species is favoured in acidic (pH < 3) with predominating species of SO\(_4^{2-}\) or strongly alkaline media (pH > 13) with predominating of hydroxyl radicals HO• [280]. However, it should be noted that such a significant pH correction (until pH of 3) will always limit the practical application of an advanced oxidation process in practice.

The concentration of organic pollutants is another parameter that determines the efficiency of photodegradation. For an optimal concentration value, the highest degradation yield can be obtained; below and beyond the threshold value, a decrease in degradation may be observed due to insufficient active sites of photocatalyst or a low number of generated reactive radicals. The highest degradation of sulfamethoxazole (SMX) by means of NiFe\(_2\)O\(_4\) was achieved at pH 3.1 with predomination of hydroxyl radicals HO• [174].

Natural aqueous systems contain natural organic matter (NOM) that originates from biogeochemical cycles and consists of a range of organic substances disseminated in water bodies. The presence of NOM, may hinder the degradation of pollutants since the NOM tends to interact with reactive oxidation species, thus blocking oxidation of contaminants by reactive radicals [281]. In higher concentrations, NOM, may block active sites of photocatalysts, decreasing thus the active surface of photocatalysts for oxidation of pollutants. Since humic acid (HA) is widely used as a model of dissolved organic matter, it was reported that in the presence of HA, the degradation rate of pollutant, i.e., tetracycline (10 mg dm\(^{-3}\)) in the presence of Ag/CQD/CuFeO\(_4\), decreased due to the quenching effect of HA [242].

In combined systems of photocatalysis and sulfate radical advanced oxidation processes (SR-AOP), temperature is an important factor, known as heat activation of persulfate (PS), that leads to an increased removal rate of studied pollutants. Zhang et al. [282] reported that the removal of diethyl phthalate (DEP), an endocrine disruptor, in the presence of a hybrid oxidation system of CuFeO\(_4\)/MWCNT + PS was significantly enhanced when the temperature was increased from 25 °C to 40 °C.

### 4.3. Economic evaluation

High stability and proper dispersion of magnetic carbon-related materials result in decreased treatment costs for removing organic pollutants from wastewater. From the reviewed literature, it was observed that there is a lack of studies concerning cost estimation related to the photocatalytic process and its scaling-up. Cost estimation includes many factors, such as cost of chemicals, equipment maintenance, labour costs and cost of energy. Acquiring this information is difficult; hence, the cost estimation of various studies was conducted with regard to the cost of energy and electrical energy per order (EEO). The price of electricity for industrial customers in Poland is 0.403 US dollars (USD) per 1 kWh (3600 kJ) [283]. The cost of treatment was firstly estimated for 1 dm\(^3\) batch volume and then for 1 m\(^3\) of treated effluent.

Electrical energy per order (EEO; kWh m\(^{-3}\) order\(^{-1}\)) is defined as the electrical energy necessary to achieve 90 % contaminant degradation (one order of magnitude) in a unit of volume effluent [295]. Electrical energy per order EEO was evaluated for the studies where more than 90 % pollutant degradation was achieved. EEO was calculated with the following equations: Eqs (27) and (28) [296].

\[
EEO \ (\text{kWh/m}^3 \text{order}^{-1}) = \frac{P_{el} \times t \times 1000}{V \times 60 \times \log\left(\frac{C_i}{C_t}\right)} \tag{27}
\]

where, \(P_{el}\) and \(t\) represent electric power (kW) and reaction time (min). The volume of treated effluent is expressed in \(\text{dm}^3\), whereas \(C_i\) and \(C_t\) stand for the initial and final concentration of studied pollutants. Since \(\log\left(\frac{C_i}{C_t}\right) = k\), where \(k\) is the pseudo-first order rate constant, the equation (28) can be transformed in the following equation (29).

\[
EEO \ (\text{kWh/m}^3 \text{order}^{-1}) = \frac{38.4 \times P_{el}}{V \times k} \tag{28}
\]
From the calculations, it was noticed that the cost of treatment related to the photocatalytic systems of magnetic carbon-related materials ranged from $0.40 \text{ USD} \cdot \text{m}^{-3}$ (Table 6, Nr 11) to the highest energy consumption cost of $9672 \text{ USD} \cdot \text{m}^{-3}$ (Table 6, Nr 3). The lowest electrical energy per order (EEO) value was estimated to be $1.45$ and $52.17 \text{ kWh} \cdot \text{m}^{-3} \cdot \text{order}^{-1}$ (Table 6, Nr 11 and Nr 14).
The investigation identified the sulfate radical-based advanced oxidation process (SR-AOP) as the most cost-effective method (Table 7). The process utilised direct sunlight as the irradiation source, which consequently contributed to reduced cost of treatment with only 8.72 USD/m³, positioning it as the most economically viable option [242]. With regard to Fenton-assisted AOP, the study conducted by Akhi et al. [257], demonstrated a low cost of treatment for operational conditions and total cost evaluated as cost of energy and oxidant with respective values of 3 USD/m³ and 21.73 USD/m³.

5. Conclusions and future prospects

Recently, advanced oxidation processes (AOPs), including photocatalysis, sulfate-based radical advanced oxidation processes (SR-AOP) and Fenton/Fenton-like reactions, are considered the most effective technologies for the treatment of waters containing trace amounts of emerging pollutants belonging to the group of pharmaceutical and phenolic compounds not susceptible to degradation.

Significant progress has been achieved in recent years in the field of heterogeneous photocatalysis, particularly in the application of carbon-related materials for improved degradation of organic pollutants. Graphitic carbon nitride (g-C₃N₄), graphene, graphene oxide (GO), reduced graphene oxide (rGO), carbon nanotubes (CNT), multi-wall carbon nanotubes (MWCNT) and carbon quantum dots (CQDs) were used for the preparation of heterocomposite with improved photocatalytic activity. Furthermore, the incorporation of ferrite particles into carbon-related materials may enhance the separation and recovery of nanosized photocatalysts after the water treatment process. Magnetic ferrites were predominately represented by spinel-type ferrites (MeFe₂O₄; Me- Cu, Zn, Fe, Cu, Ni, Mn, Mg), hematite (Fe₂O₃), magnetite (Fe₃O₄) and a few studies on orthoferrites (MeFeO₃; Me-La, Sr). Different types of heterojunction of carbon-related materials (CRM) and magnetic ferrites were described. These consisted of three main types of heterocomposites such as CRM/magnetic ferrite, CRM/magnetic ferrite/CRM, and magnetic ferrite/CRM/magnetic ferrite. Moreover, the combination of photocatalysis process in the presence of these types of heterocomposite with sulfate radical advanced oxidation process (SR-AOPs) and Fenton-type photocatalysis demonstrated to enhance the photodegradation of selected organic pollutants synergistically. Studied pharmaceuticals utilizing carbon-based materials modified with magnetic ferrite are classified antiepileptic drugs (carbamazepine), anti-inflammatory drugs (diclofenac, ibuprofen), analgesic (paracetamol), antimicrobial (sulphonamide), antibiotics (cefalexin, sulfamethoxazole, spiramycin, chloramphenicol, chloromycetin), penicillin-type antibiotics (amoxicillin, ampicillin), quinolone type antibotics (ciprofloxacin, ofloxacin, norfloxacin, lomefloxacin) and B-blocker agent (propranolol hydrochloride). Regarding phenolic compounds, they belong to phenol, 2,4 dimethylphenol, 4-chlorophenol (para), 2-chlorophenol (ortho), 4-nitrophenol (para, and 2-nitrophenol (ortho). Additionally, all studied photocatalysts demonstrated to have remarkable recovery and stability properties, they exhibited to be stable from three up to eight consecutive cycles of pollutant photodegradation.

Despite the progress that was made related to the modification of carbon-related materials with magnetic ferrites, there are still significantly fewer studies focusing on the photodegradation of pharmaceuticals not susceptible to biodegradation and phenolic compounds compared to dyes photodegradation. The studies belong to the very recent years, suggesting that the topic is quite new for the photodegradation of discussed pollutants, and further efforts are needed in order to have a broad spectrum of the mechanism of these types of photocatalysts with active pharmaceutical ingredients and phenolic compounds. Additionally, toxicity assessments of used photocatalysts should be established and discussed. Many aspects are not fully covered yet, particularly low-cost preparation methods and the effect of sulfate ions presence when significant amounts of PMS or PS are used in SR-AOP process.

At the same time, new photoreactors with potential for implementation in industrial practice are an essential element of process development. There is also a need for gaining a better understanding of the effects of process indicators on the efficiency of pharmaceuticals and phenolic compounds degradation for elucidating the reaction kinetics with the view to optimising the photocatalytic process. The integrated water treatment system includes a photoreactor and magnetic separator for the recovery of the magnetic photocatalyst particles, which seems to be crucial for the technological application of photocatalysts. Therefore, future studies should focus on the development of new photoreactors as well on the economic feasibility of photocatalytic processes, whether they are efficient on laboratory scale or industrial scale processes.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Elvana Çako: Conceptualization, Investigation, Methodology, Writing – original draft, Writing – review & editing. Kumaravel Dinesh Gunasekaran: Writing – review & editing. Saravanan Rajendran: Writing – review & editing. Anna Zielińska-Jurek: Funding acquisition, Writing – review & editing.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Data availability

No data was used for the research described in the article.
Acknowledgement

The research was financially supported by the Polish National Science Centre grant no. NCN 2021/43/B/ST5/02983. The author acknowledges the support of Gdańsk University of Technology within the Oxigenium Programme.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wri.2024.100241.

References


